

Monsieur le Président de la République Palais de l'Elysée 55, rue du Faubourg Saint-Honoré 75008 Paris

Dear Mr. Sarkozy,

Paris, July 12<sup>th</sup>, 2011

In the wake of the ongoing nuclear catastrophe in Fukushima, we are writing to you to express our deep concern regarding the French Government's upcoming decision on an export guarantee for the Jaitapur Nuclear Power Project (NPP) in India.

Jaitapur is not only slated to become the world's largest nuclear power complex, it is sited in a "high risk" zone for earthquakes on India's western coastline. Although three tectonic faults transverse the area, these risks were ignored during site selection for the NPP.

Currently, India has 19 operating nuclear reactors of which 17 are 220 MW reactors and two are 540 MW reactors. The reactors proposed for Jaitapur are of an entirely different scale (1,650 MW) and are designed to use high fuel burn-up, which places much higher requirements on the quality of construction, maintenance and oversight. As India's safety record shows, however, even the management of its relatively small reactors has been characterized by poor safety standards and immense technical problems – one of the most extreme examples being the collapse of the Kaiga NPP containment in 1994.

In view of the four unit concurrent accident in Fukushima and the fact that regulators have yet to evaluate lessons learnt here, it seems an extreme folly to support the construction of one of the world's largest nuclear complexes in a high risk earthquake zone in a country with low nuclear safety standards, immense corruption problems, no independent regulator and no experience with operating reactors of this magnitude.

While EU legislation requires that "member states shall ensure that the competent regulatory authority is functionally separate from any other body or organization concerned with the promotion or utilization of nuclear energy," India's Atomic Regulatory Board (AERB) does not meet these requirements.

The AERB reports to the Department of Atomic Energy (DAE), which is responsible for the promotion of nuclear power and is also the owner of NPCIL, the utility that wants to build and operate Jaitapur. As stated by Dr. Gopalakrishnan, a former chairman of AERB, this is a serious nuclear safety concern: "This dependency is deliberately exploited by the DAE management to influence directly and indirectly, the AERB's safety evaluations and decisions. This interference has manifested itself in the AERB toning down the seriousness of safety concerns, agreeing to the postponement of essential repairs (...) and allowing the continued operation of installations when

#### Contacts :

public safety considerations would warrant their immediate shutdown and repair." While the Indian Government recently indicated its intention to create an independent and autonomous nuclear regulatory authority sometime in the future, it has, however, not slowed down the approval and preparation process for Jaitapur.

In this context, we would also like to point out that the units planned in Jaitapur show a number of design weaknesses, which make them vulnerable to similar accident scenarios as in Fukushima. Spent fuel ponds are for example located outside the containment area, making them vulnerable to damage and a potential source of major radiation releases into the environment; the control room is located close to the reactor, making it inaccessible in case of serious radiation leakage; and the back-up diesel generators are located close to the ground, making them susceptible to flooding.

As you are probably also aware, India is one of the very few countries that have refused to sign the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty. This makes it impossible to ascertain that the acquired technology and nuclear material will not be used for military applications.

In addition, it should be noted that the environmental licensing process for Jaitapur has violated both Indian law and the OECD common approaches for export credit agencies by denying affected communities access to the Environmental Impact Assessment Report and beginning forced acquisition of land without prior community hearings. Accordingly, the project has already led to massive social conflicts and strong local opposition. As recently as April 2011, a demonstrator was killed by the police and over 1,500 people were detained during protests against Jaitapur.

For all of the above reasons, the Jaitapur Project is extremely controversial.

The project's seismic risks as well as the poor quality of management and safety standards in the Indian nuclear sector make Jaitapur a prime candidate for a second Fukushima. In the interest of nuclear safety, the undersigned organizations therefore urge you to withhold export credit guarantees for this project.

We look forward to your reply and would welcome the chance to discuss this matter in more detail in a meeting with your staff.

Sincerely,

<u>Copie à</u> : François Fillon, Premier Ministre François Baroin, Ministre de l'Économie, des Finances et de l'Industrie Nathalie Kosciusko-Morizet, Ministre de l'Ecologie, du Développement Durable, des Transports et du Logement Alain Juppé, Ministre des Affaires Etrangères et Européennes Christophe Viprey, Directeur des Garanties Publiques, COFACE

# First signatories

Sophia Majnoni, Greenpeace France Juliette Renaud, Les Amis de la Terre France Heffa Schücking, Urgewald (Germany) Yann Louvel, BankTrack (International) Elvira Pöschko, Antiatom Szene (Austria) Peer de Rijk, WISE (Netherlands)

Contacts :

Michael Mariotte, Nuclear Information and Resource Service (US) Deborah Lambert Perez, ECA Wacth (International)

### **Other signatories**

# FRANCE

Steven Mitchell, Réseau Sortir du Nucléaire Nicolas Sersiron, CADTM France Maxime Combes, Aitec/Ipam Georges Cingal, Secrétaire Général, Fédération SEPANSO Patrice Perret, Union syndicale Solidaires Marie Toussaint and Noe Pflieger, Jeunes écologistes Mathieu Agostini and Corinne Morel-Darleux, Parti de Gauche Anne Isabelle Veillot and Stéphane Madelaine, Parti Pour La Décroissance

# INDIA

Karuna Raina, Greenpeace India Gopal Krishna, ToxicsWatch Alliance Soumya Dutta, Bharat Jan Vigyan Jatha Mamata Dash, Human Rights Activist and Independent Researcher Praful Bidwai, Columnist and Member, Coalition for Nuclear Disarmament and Peace S.P. Udayakumar, National Alliance of Anti-Nuclear Movements (NAAM) Subhash Sule, SACHETAN

# GERMANY

Heike Drillisch, CounterCurrent - GegenStrömung Uwe Hiksch, Bundesvorstand NaturFreunde Deutschlands Elke Rothkopf, Institute for Ecology and Action Anthropology Dr. Walter Ulbrich, Oikocredit Förderkreis Bayern Dr. Alfred Koerblein, retired physicist, formerly with the Munich Environmental Institute

# UNITED KINGDOM

Juliet Swann, Friends of the Earth Scotland Nigel Day, Oxford Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament Ralph Ryder, Coordinator, Communities Against Toxics Jo Brown, PCAH (Parents Concerned About Hinkley) Pat Sanchez, Greater Manchester and District Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament Philip Gilligan, Rochdale and Littleborough Peace Group Dr Gerry Wolff, Energy Fair Andy Kadir-Buxton, A-PAC Nicholas Hildyard, The Corner House

# ITALY

Andrea Baranes, Campagna per la Riforma della Banca Mondiale

#### **SPAIN**

Tom Kucharz, Ecologistas en Acción Monica Vargas, Observatori del Deute en la Globalitzación Jesús Navarro, Tanquem les nuclears'' Catalonia Josep Puig, Phd, Group of Scientists and Technicians for a Non Nuclear Future Catalonia Carlos Arribas Ugarte, Coordinador de la Federación Ecologistes en Acció del País Valencià

#### Contacts :

# BELGIUM

Eloi Glorieux, Energy Campaigner, Greenpeace Belgium

# **NETHERLANDS**

Wiert Wiertsema, Both Ends Annelies Ten Hagen, Borssele 2 Nee Margreet Elings, member of WISE Amsterdam

# DENMARK

Henning Bo Madsen NOAH - Friends of the Earth Denmark

# AUSTRIA

Heinz Stockinger, Plattform gegen Atomgefahren / Platform Against Nuclear Dangers Maria Urban, Wiener Plattform Atomkraftfrei Johanna Nekowitsch, Wiener Plattform Atomkraftfrei

### SWEDEN

Eia Liljegren-Palmær, Swedish Anti Nuclear Movement

# FINLAND

Ulla Klotzer, Women Against Nuclear Power Lea Launokari, Women for Peace

# PORTUGAL

Alba Valle Basanta, Euronatura - Centro para o Direito Ambiental e Desenvolvimento Sustentado

### GREECE

Apostolos Panagiotou, "Marangopoulos Foundation for Human Rights (MFHR), Committee Against Nuclear Dangers (CAND)

#### ROMANIA

Ioana-Noemy Toma, President, Association "Pro vita universale"

# EUROPE

Magda Stoczkiewicz, Friends of the Earth Europe

# **UNITED STATES**

Susan Corbett, Sierra Club Nuclear Issues Team Jim Riccio, Greenpeace Ellen and Paul Connett, Fluoride Action Network Marylia Kelley, Tri-Valley CAREs (Communities Against a Radioactive Environment) Susan Clark, Committee to Bridge the Gap, CA Judy Treichel, Nevada Nuclear Waste Task Force, NV Patricia A. Marida, Ohio Sierra Club Nuclear Issues Committee Patricia Birnie, GE Stockholders Alliance, AZ Peter Wilk, Executive Director, Physicians for Social Responsibility Charles K. Johnson, Director, Center for Energy Research, OR Rinaldo Brutoco, World Business Academy, CA Jeff Strain, Cumberland Countians for Peace & Justice, TN Donald B. Clark, Network for Environmental & Economic Responsibility, United Church of Christ, TN Stephen M. Brittle, Don't Waste Arizona,

#### Contacts :

Dr. Lewis Cuthbert, Alliance For A Clean Environment, PA Carolyn Treadway, No New Nukes, IL Cara L. Campbell, Ecology Party of Florida Vivek Ananthan, Center For Creative Activities, PA David Hartsough, PEACEWORKERS, CA Mary Beth Brangan, Ecological Options Network, CA Lynn Howard Ehrle, Chair, International Science Oversight Board, MI Alice Slater, Nuclear Age Peace Foundation, NY Adele Kushner, Executive Director, Action for a Clean Environment, GA Gladys Schmitz, Mankato Area Environmentalists, MN Norma J F Harrison, Peace and Freedom Party, CA Buffalo Bruce, Western Nebraska Resources Council Wells Eddleman, NC Citizens Research Group, NC Coralie Koonce, PASE (People's Action for Safe Energy), AR Louis Zeller, Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League, NC Jim Puckett, Executive Director, Basel Action Network Alan Muller, Executive Director, Green Delaware, DE Susan Flint

# CANADA

Dr. William R. Adamson, InterChurch Uranium Committee Educational Co-Operative, Saskatchewan Angela Bischoff, Greenspiration Ziggy Kleinau, Bruce Peninsula Environment Group, Ontario Mike Nickerson, Sustainability Project/7th Generation Initiative Sylvie Van Brabant, Productions du Rapide-Blanc Darlene Buckingham, Earthdance Studio

# MEXICO

Luis Gutierrez-Esparza, Latin American Circle of International Studies (LACIS)

# ARGENTINA

Prof. Dr. Raul A. Montenegro, President of FUNAM (Fundacion para la defensa del ambiente)

# **AUSTRALIA**

Robert Durbridge, SEARCH Foundation David Noonan, Australian Conservation Foundation Mary Madigan, Friends of Westernport Marcus Atkinson, Footprints for Peace Derek Schild, Australian Greens Convenor Australian Greens Senator Scott Ludlam

# JAPAN

Kuniko Takagi, Takagi Fund for Citizen Science, Tokyo

# RUSSIA

Alexey Yablokov, Programme on Nuclear and Radiation Safety, International Social Ecological Union Vladimir Slivyak, Ecodefense

Petr Sharov, Far Eastern Environmental Health Fund

Alexey Zimenko, Biodiversity Conservation Center

# Contacts :

TURKEY Orkut Murat, YILMAZ

### THAILAND

Nicola Bullard, Focus on the Global South

### MALAYSIA

Mohamed Idris, President of Sahabat Alam (Friends of the Earth) Malaysia Mageswari Sangaralingam, Consumers' Association of Penang

#### SOUTH AFRICA

Muna Lakhani, Earthlife Africa Rod Gurzynski, CANE-Coalition Against Nuclear Energy

#### UGANDA

Ellady Muyambi, Secretary General, Uganda Network on Toxic Free Malaria Control(UNETMAC)

Hamed Beheshti. IndyACT, The League of Independent Activists, (Lebanon, Austria, Egypt)